

**Indiana University Librarians  
Promotion and Tenure Committee  
Annual Report  
2006-2007**

**Promotion and Tenure Committee 2006-2007**

**Bloomington**

Gary Charbonneau (2005-2007)  
Diane Dallis (2006-2008), Chair-Elect  
Bob Goehlert (2006-2007)  
Anne Haynes (2005-2007) Secretary

**IUPUI**

James Baldwin (2006-2008)  
Todd Daniels-Howell (2005-2007)  
Mahnaz Moshfegh (2006-2008)

**Regional Campuses**

Lora Baldwin (2006-2008)  
Cheryl Truesdell (2005-2007) Chair

Virginia Sojdehei, ex officio, Human Resources Librarian  
BJ Irvine, ex officio, Special Ombudsman

**Promotion and Tenure Committee Organizational Meeting**

The IULFC Promotion and Tenure Committee had an organizational meeting on August 31, 2006. Committee members present were Jim Baldwin, Lora Baldwin, Gary Charbonneau, Diane Dallis, Bob Goehlert, Anne Haynes, Mahnaz Moshfegh, Todd Daniels-Howell, Cheryl Truesdell, Virginia Sojdehei, ex officio; and Dean Pat Steele, guest.

Dean Steele informed the Committee that Virginia Sojdehei would not be able to serve as ex officio member of the Committee during P & T Week due to an upcoming sick leave. The Committee asked that a senior librarian who could act as ombudsman, if needed, be appointed to sit in on the deliberations of the committee. BJ Irvine agreed to be the committee's ombudsman.

The Committee chose officers for the 2006-2007 year. Diane Dallis was selected as Vice-Chair/Chair-Elect of the committee and Anne Haynes as Secretary.

Cheryl reviewed the charge from IULFC to this year's Committee - "Continue to review/monitor documentation on the Intranet. Clarify and revise manual (P & T Committee Manual) in regards to tenure and continuing promise, further discussion on a sample dossier (whether fake or real) and report back to IULFC with recommendation." Cheryl agreed to review/monitor documentation on the Intranet.

As to clarifying and revising the IULFC P & T Committee Manual in regard to tenure and continuing promise, the committee believes that the Manual already clearly states the criteria as found in the *IU Libraries Librarian Faculty Handbook*. The Committee recommends that the phrase “...tenure shall be granted to those librarians whose professional characteristics indicate they will continue to serve with distinction in their appointed roles ...” be specifically noted when reviewing cases for tenure. The Committee also recommends that IU Bloomington members who meet with candidates for librarian positions should tell the candidates that they will eventually have to present a dossier for tenure, unless they are hired with tenure, regardless of their rank at the time of hiring, and explain the difference between the criteria for promotion and for tenure.

### **Promotion and Tenure Committee System-wide Review**

The Committee met in Bloomington from September 25 – September 28, 2006 to consider dossiers for promotion and tenure and mid-tenure review. There were questions regarding how and when Committee members should excuse themselves from a case. Based upon information provided by Virginia Sojdehei, if one believes he or she should be excused from a vote on a specific case, or if a committee member believes another member should be excused from a vote, they are to tell the Chair. The Chair will then hold a vote among the committee to determine whether a committee member should be excused.

Due to an illness of one of the Committee members one case resulted in a tie vote. BJ Irvine, acting as ombudsman for the Committee, requested information from the University Administration on correct procedure. The Committee was reminded that any member of the Committee can ask for another vote on a case until the Committee has adjourned.

Two librarians requested that the Committee reconsider their cases and submitted additional information. The P & T Committee reconvened on October 30, 2006 to reconsider these cases. The cases were reviewed and another vote taken and letters written to the candidates.

Deleted: for librarian

Deleted: .

In May 2007 the Dean of Libraries, Pat Steele, asked that the Committee be informed that in one of the cases a librarian was promoted even though the IULFC Promotion and Tenure Committee had reviewed the case twice and twice voted against promotion and the Dean of Libraries twice agreed with the IULFC Promotion and Tenure Committee. However, the campus faculty committee voted for promotion as did the Chancellor at the campus. When the case came back to the IU campus it was not reviewed carefully by the appropriate offices and the case was signed off and passed along to the President and the Board of Trustees without the knowledge of or consultation with the Dean of Libraries. Dean of Libraries, Pat Steele, has spoken to the Dean of Faculties Office about this and has been reassured that this was an unusual case of human error and that they will be more careful in the future to carefully review each case and consult with the Dean of Libraries when the system-wide Promotion and Tenure Committee’s recommendation conflicts with the campus committee. She assured the members that the work of the IULFC Promotion and Tenure Committee is very important to maintaining high

academic standards for tenure and promotion and that the Committee should not be discouraged by this oversight.

During the last meeting of Promotion and Tenure week the Committee discussed issues and concerns raised during the week. Dossier preparation and presentation remains problematic. Some dossiers contained spelling and grammatical errors that reflect badly on the candidate, supervisor, and the Libraries. Cases still contain too much extraneous material that overshadows significant achievements. Finally, it was apparent that some candidates spent too much time making the case for Professional Development and/or Service and not making the case for excellence in performance or exceptional achievement in performance. After much discussion the Committee agreed to the following:

Deleted: and

1. Recommend at the P & T Workshops that librarians have one or more colleagues read their dossiers before submitting it to the Committee.
2. Recommend that the P & T Committee explore other ways of assisting librarians who are preparing dossiers. Some suggestions are preparing on online tutorial or providing a mock P & T Committee presentation.

The Committee also discussed changes that could be made in the P & T Committee Manual to alleviate some of the problems encountered during the week. The Manual still includes, in some places, reference to the old criteria for promotion and tenure. The Committee also noted the importance of the campus mission statement and job descriptions and recommended that these documents be added to the packet sent to Committee members prior to P & T Week. We also agreed that the mission statement of the campus/library be read as part of the presentation of the case. The Chair agreed to go through the Manual thoroughly and make all necessary and recommended changes.

The Committee also discussed the number and location of P & T Workshops for 2007. With the uncertainty of the status of IUPUI librarians in the IU Librarians System-wide committee, it was agreed to plan two workshops, one in Bloomington and one in the northern part of the state, and also one at IU Librarian's day, if possible. The Secretary agreed to review the Promotion and Tenure PowerPoint used at the Workshops and make sure they are up-to-date.

Deleted: ,

Deleted: s

#### **Number and Distribution of Cases considered:**

- 10 cases for tenure and promotion to Associate Librarian
- 4 cases for promotion to Librarian
- 2 cases for mid-tenure review

#### **Promotion and Tenure Workshops**

The Committee presented a workshop in Bloomington on May 10, 2007, at the IPFW Warsaw Center on May 18, 2007 and at IU Librarian's Day on June 1, 2007. These

workshops included presentations on the “Role of Tenure in Academic Libraries,” “Criteria for Tenure and Promotion,” “Promotion and Tenure Process,” “Role of the Supervisor,” “Role and Activities of the Committee,” “Dossier Preparation,” “Resources for Support,” and the “Mid-Tenure Review.”

### **Meeting Candidates for Library positions**

Deleted: ??

Bloomington members of the committee met with the following candidates for tenure track librarian positions on the Bloomington campus.

Middle Eastern Studies Librarian:

Bob Goehlert and Anne Haynes met with Akram Khabibullaev

Islamic, and Central Eurasian Studies Librarian:

Gary Charbonneau and Diane Dallis met with Mary St. Germain

Music Collections Development Librarian and Associate Director of the William and Gayle Cook Music Library:

Diane Dallis and Anne Haynes met with Keith Cochran

Gary Charbonneau and Diane Dallis met with Martin Jenkins

Bob Goehlert and Anne Haynes met with Stephen Luttmann

Head of the Fine Arts Library

Diane Dallis and Anne Haynes met with Sara Harrington

Gary Charbonneau and Diane Dallis met with Terrie Wilson

Bob Goehlert and Anne Haynes met with Tony White

Law Library

Anne Haynes met with Catherine Dunn

Digital Reference Services Librarian (will take place on June 28<sup>th</sup>)

Gary Charbonneau will meet with Jennifer Laherty

### **Issues for IULFC Follow-up**

Deleted:

1. There has been some question about who should get the official letters of results from the P & T Committee. We believe that the librarian's direct supervisor and director of the library should get the letter. We request IULFC discuss and make a recommendation on this.
2. Very late in the summer of 2006 the IULFC P & T Committee was still not sure which cases for promotion and tenure they would be reviewing because IUPUI librarians had asked their administration to change the routing of their cases to exclude the IU system-wide P & T Committee. IUPUI librarian cases were reviewed by the system-wide P & T Committee in 2006, but the issue was not resolved during the fall and spring 2006-2007. The removal of IUPUI librarians from the P & T Committee is a serious concern. Promotion and Tenure is

stressful enough for librarians without the uncertainty of the makeup of the Committee. Any new procedures or change in the Committee should be decided well before they take affect.

Report prepared by:  
Cheryl Truesdell, Chair  
IULFC Promotion and Tenure Committee, 2006-2007  
June 12, 2007