

May 14, 2004

President Adam Herbert
Bryan Hall 200
Indiana University

Dear President Herbert,

The members of the Task Force on the Graduate School are looking forward to meeting with you on Tuesday, May 25, at 9:00 a.m. to discuss our preliminary report.

The report is preliminary in part because we recommend that if any central unit for graduation education is to exist, it should report to the Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs. We are not sure, however, what responsibilities you intend to define for this position. We do not know, therefore, whether or how responsibilities for graduate education would fit in this vice president's portfolio. The report is preliminary also because the findings of the project on mission differentiation for IU's campuses may well have a bearing on the mission and role of a university-wide unit responsible for graduate education.

After you have read the report enclosed and have discussed it with the Task Force, we would be grateful for your guidance on the form and content of the final report you expect from us.

Sincerely,

Task Force Members

A PRELIMINARY REPORT
TASK FORCE ON GRADUATE EDUCATION
MAY 2004

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

To ensure standards of quality across units and graduate programs, the faculty of the College of Arts and Sciences in Bloomington insisted in 1908 that a Graduate School be established. In addition to the Ph.D., the Graduate School now has jurisdiction over the Master of Arts, the Master of Science, the Master of Arts for Teachers, and the Master of Fine Arts degrees wherever they are offered university-wide. The professional schools have jurisdiction over other post-baccalaureate professional degrees, including some master's and doctoral degrees (but not Ph.D.s). As a university-wide office, the Graduate School grants degrees at five of the university's eight campuses: Bloomington, Fort Wayne, Indianapolis, South Bend, and Southeast.

Over time, the members of the University Graduate School faculty have acquired the responsibility to:

- *determine standards of admission;
- *set general requirements for degrees;
- *pass upon specific requirements of programs;
- *approve courses for graduate credit; and
- *certify candidates for degrees.

These functions are executed by the Graduate Council, made up of 30 voting members elected by the University Graduate School faculty from all campuses and representing professional as well as arts and sciences departments, and by the dean and administrative staff of the University Graduate School.

The Graduate and Professional Student Organization (GPSO) represents all graduate and professional students enrolled in Bloomington programs to the university administration, faculty, staff, and other student organizations. The Graduate Student Organization (GSO) does the same for students enrolled in IUPUI programs. The GPSO and GSO advise the Graduate School about issues affecting graduate and professional students and also provide information and service opportunities for students. The GPSO and GSO appoint students to sit on university committees that act on such matters as academics, employment and working conditions, health care, insurance, and housing issues.

For most of its existence, the Graduate School had been an independent unit. With the appointment in August 1989 of George Walker as Vice President for Research, the Graduate School became part of the office of Research and the University Graduate School (RUGS). Walker became Dean of the University Graduate School as well as Vice President for Research.

Because of his dual portfolio, Walker delegated much of the responsibility for graduate education at Bloomington to two part-time associate deans. At IUPUI, those dual responsibilities are administered by one person, a Vice Chancellor for Research & Graduate Education and Associate Vice President for Research. That person is assisted by an associate dean in the University Graduate School, who is also director of the Graduate Office at IUPUI. These two people have both university-wide and campus-specific responsibility.

At the university-wide level, President Myles Brand decided in 2002 to divide the position of Vice President for Research and Dean of the University Graduate School into offices held by separate individuals and to change the title of the dean. In 2002-03, a university-wide committee accountable to the Vice President for Research searched nationally for a Dean of Graduate Studies. John Slattery took office as dean in November 2003, reporting to the Vice President for Research.

CHARGE TO THE TASK FORCE ON THE GRADUATE SCHOOL

The Graduate School was last reviewed 20 years ago, in 1983. As the centenary of the University Graduate School approaches in 2008 and after the appointment of the new Dean of Graduate Studies, President Adam Herbert charged a Task Force on the Graduate School to consider whether any administrative unit for graduate education should continue to exist at IU. If the Task Force were to recommend that it should, President Herbert asked what form and functions the unit should have and to whom it should report.

The Task Force met with President Herbert on January 28, 2004. It divided responsibility for interviews among members according to their academic unit and campus. They interviewed more than 60 IU administrators, faculty members and graduate students university wide. The Task Force also received a number of responses to President Herbert's charge from individual faculty members on all campuses.

The reactions and concerns of most of these interviewees and respondents are rooted in their experience of the Graduate School through to November 2003, particularly in its existence for the past 14 years as part of RUGS. Most had had little to no experience with the new leadership of the independent University Graduate School in its six months of service between November 2003 and May 2004.

The factors below seem to explain differences of opinion in response to President Herbert's questions:

- *the different stages of development in graduate education of each campus;
- *the different missions, needs and markets for graduate education at each campus;

- *the different purposes and systems of internal and external accountability between arts and sciences units and professional schools; and
- *concern about the assessment charge on academic units for the Graduate School through RUGS, particularly by units that have invested significantly in their own infrastructure for graduate education.

The interactions of these factors in a complex, multi-campus university underlie the three options the Task Force will present at the end of this report. There is consensus that some responsibilities for graduate education should exist at the university-wide level, some at the campus level and some at the academic unit level. However, respondents and members of the Task Force differ, and on some issues quite sharply, in their analysis of the nature, extent and location of these responsibilities.

FINDINGS

Responsibilities for Graduate Education

Most respondents, representing arts and sciences and professional units on at least three campuses, believe that some responsibilities for graduate education should exist above the academic unit level. They are united in perceiving a number of problems with the mission and practices of the University Graduate School, at least through November 2003. These problems include the view that the Graduate School is a bureaucratic obstacle to innovation and efficient management and a poor coordinator and communicator. Their complaints echo those of previous reviews of the Graduate School, now expressed with greater intensity because the cost of the School to units has become more visible and painful under RCM and assessment.

Representatives of the graduate student organizations at Bloomington and Indianapolis did not feel they could comment on issues of structure but did want a strong administrative voice for the interests, concerns and needs of all graduate students.

A Service-Oriented University Graduate School

Those who want a university-wide graduate school favor a service rather than command-and-control center. They favor a University Graduate School with appropriate and accountable local administrators and responsibility, because resources are mainly campus-based. Units, programs, faculty members and students need coordination and help at the campus level for everyday operations. At the same time, advocates of a university graduate school, and they include the deans of Health Schools at IUPUI, are united in the opinion that the graduate school should play an important role in setting principles and policies for research-based Ph.D. and M.S. degree training at Indiana University.

A number of people outside Bloomington -- and, to some extent, Indianapolis -- want a university-wide unit that understands the responsibilities of smaller campuses to respond to the demands and opportunities for graduate education in their areas in ways that differ from the doctoral and master's orientation of Bloomington. They want a unit that will support and not impede the different missions for education and for graduate education that the diversity of campuses serves. To a great extent, the new Dean of Graduate Studies was expected to develop a university graduate school that would achieve these goals.

Graduate students at Bloomington report that changes in the past six months indicate that the University Graduate School is responding effectively to graduate student issues (including health care, student fees, professional development, and mentoring). They are concerned that decentralizing responsibility for graduation education even further may harm their interests in graduate education of high quality and disperse and perhaps dilute attention to their concerns.

Graduate students at IUPUI report, however, that these changes have not yet produced a response to all of their interests -- or that the changes have not yet been communicated to them. They appreciate the change in health care options that the Graduate School negotiated but continue to have concerns about fees, fellowships, and payment of their stipends.

Nevertheless, some Task Force members and the constituencies they represent are not convinced that the value to Indiana University promised in this new arrangement justifies the layer of administration involved and the costs to units of funding it.

Academic Unit Control of Graduate Education

Those who believe that the University Graduate School should be abolished, and they include the leadership of the College of Arts and Sciences, the Kelley School of Business and SPEA, are united in the conviction that their units could put the assessments they pay to RUGS to sustain the Graduate School to more effective use in promoting the quality of graduate education in their units. Some units in Bloomington are particularly concerned to have the fellowship funds for graduate students allocated directly to them rather than to have them allocated by the Graduate School.

The budget for the Graduate School in 2003-04 was \$5.3 million, approximately \$4.1 million or 78 percent of which was assessment income from Bloomington (paid to RUGS). Fellowship funds under the control of the Graduate School amounted in 2003-04 to \$3.05 million, or 57 percent of its budget. The administrative costs of the Graduate School (salaries and benefits) totaled \$1.1 million, or about 19 percent of its budget. IUPUI pays the operating costs of the Graduate Office on its campus.

However, academic units in Bloomington have been more aware of the assessments they pay to RUGS than they have been of the budget RUGS has created for the Graduate School. For example, of the total net assessment revenue of \$15.8 million that RUGS received in 2003-04, COAS contributed \$6.9 million, Business \$2.4 million, Education \$1.8 million, HPER \$300,000 and SPEA \$614,000. (These figures have been rounded.)

Those who oppose a unit for graduate education say that individual units are much more responsible than the Graduate School for the state of graduate programs. These units function as true schools. The Graduate School does not; it must rely on the faculty and infrastructure of other units to execute the responsibilities assigned it over time.

Others who question the need for a university-wide graduate school, and they include the leadership of the School of Education and HPER, do so because they believe the role and purposes of the present Graduate School are ill-defined and unclear. Under the circumstances, they would prefer that funds for administering graduate education be reallocated to the academic units. At the same time, they believe there is a need for an agency external to the academic units that would be responsible for quality control and for monitoring disputes and duplication across and within campuses and units.

Reporting Line

Most respondents recommend that, if a central unit is to exist, it should report to the Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs. Some think the responsibility for graduate education should be part of this vice president's direct responsibility (i.e., there is no need for a dean of graduate education). A few people think the unit should report directly to the President. One or two think it should continue to report to the Vice President for Research.

RECOMMENDATIONS: THREE OPTIONS

A Reformed University Graduate School

Indiana University has a strong interest in establishing and maintaining standards for graduate education university wide. To keep up with issues and ideas regionally, nationally and internationally, the university benefits from participation in academic organizations and activities dedicated to graduate education. In addition to performing these roles, a University Graduate School can administer certain functions such as negotiating health insurance options for graduate students and addressing visa regulations for international students more cost-effectively than individual campuses and academic units. In such ways, a University Graduate School can serve as a resource of expertise and experience on which campuses and academic units at different stages in the development of graduate education can draw.

Support for this option is contingent on performance and accountability. Details for implementing this option, including budgetary matters, an appropriate balance between authority and responsibility, and relationships among the Graduate School, the campuses and the academic units will need to be worked out.

1. The Graduate School should be reorganized as a university-wide unit responsible for graduate education that reports to the Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs.
2. The mission and functions of the University Graduate School should be to:
 - *set university-wide standards and goals for graduate education
 - *advocate the purposes, needs and interests of graduate education
 - *help resolve issues and conflicts in graduate education among campuses and units such as duplication and proposals for research programs and degrees
 - *ensure that program reviews happen regularly
 - *respond to and address the interests and concerns of graduate and post-doctoral students
 - *collect and analyze data on graduate education
 - *help raise funds to support graduate education
 - *represent Indiana University's interests in graduate education at the local, state, national and international levels
3. Such issues and functions as curriculum, program development, and graduate faculty membership should be determined at the campus or school level. The distribution of graduate fellowships should be worked out at the campus level.
4. Professional degrees that follow the guidelines of professional societies and accrediting organizations should continue outside the jurisdiction of the University Graduate School.
5. The University Graduate School should decide whether the Graduate Council or some other system of faculty governance should continue to exist at the university-wide and/or campus levels, and, if so, what its membership and functions should be.

6. The Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs should provide an appropriate annual budget for the University Graduate School, identify the assessment to campuses and units for the operation of the office, and ensure that the office is annually accountable to the campuses and academic units for the use of its funds.
7. The University Graduate School should undergo an initial review in three years and every five years thereafter.

A University-Wide Office of Graduate Studies

A university-wide office with a limited central role in graduate education is the natural extension of a clearly delineated and decentralized functional operation and reflects the decentralized nature of graduate studies and budgeting at IU. It need not be administered by a dean; it could be adequately served by a director.

1. A university-wide Office of Graduate Studies administered by a director who reports to the Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs should be established with the following functions:
 - *to advocate the purposes, needs and interests of graduate education
 - *to help resolve issues and conflicts in graduate education among campuses and units such as duplication and proposals for research programs and degrees
 - *to ensure that program reviews happen regularly
 - *to respond to and address the interests and concerns of graduate and post-doctoral students
 - *to collect and analyze data on graduate education
 - *to represent Indiana University's interests in graduate education at the local, state, national and international levels
2. The academic units should be responsible for ensuring the quality and efficient management of their graduate degrees, subject to the system of program review already in place in these units and to the professional and accrediting organizations to which some units are accountable.
3. Responsibility and funding for graduate students should be assigned to each academic unit to ensure that it has the support it needs. A strong campus-level system of support and assistance for graduate students should be developed to address whatever issues and needs the academic units do not or cannot address.

4. Decisions about new graduate programs and degrees should be made at the chancellor's level on each campus, subject to guidelines the President's initiative for mission differentiation may recommend and to the oversight of the President.
5. The university-wide Office of Graduate Studies should undergo an initial review in three years and every five years thereafter.

Abolition of the University Graduate School

The Graduate School has fulfilled the mission and tasks set for it in 1908. No need for it any longer exists. Indiana University's organization has changed fundamentally since the early twentieth century. A move away from a centralized graduate school has been occurring for decades. Schools have appointed associate deans or directors of graduate studies and their own academic councils and have been assuming the cost and direction of graduate education in their respective fields.

1. The Senior Vice President for Academic Affairs should carry out whatever university-level responsibilities in graduate education are necessary, including those defined in #1 for "A University-Wide Office of Graduate Studies."
2. The academic units should continue to manage graduate education in their units, including the responsibilities defined in #2 and #3 for "A University-Wide Office of Graduate Studies."
3. Academic units should submit proposals for new graduate programs and degrees to the chancellor of the campus.
4. Administration of graduate education should undergo an initial review in three years and every five years thereafter.

Task Force Members

Diane Billings, School of Nursing, IUPUI
William Bosron, Department of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, IUPUI
Trevor Brown, School of Journalism, IUB & IUPUI (chair)
Carolyn Calloway-Thomas, Department of Communication & Culture, Bloomington
Michelle Carroll, Institute of Psychiatric Research, IUPUI
Ain Haas, Department of Sociology, IUPUI
John Hill, Kelley School of Business, Bloomington
Estelle Jorgensen, School of Music, Bloomington
Paul Kochanowski, School of Business & Economics, South Bend
Richard Nash, Department of English, Bloomington
Jesse Nelson, School of Education, Bloomington
Eugene O'Brien, School of Music, Bloomington
Elizabeth Raff, Department of Biology, Bloomington
William Schneider, Department of History, IUPUI
Gail Vance, School of Medicine, IUPUI

Ex officio:

John Slattery, Dean of Graduate Studies